

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee:	West/Centre Area	Ward:	Dringhouses And Woodthorpe
Date:	18 February 2010	Parish:	Dringhouses/Woodthorpe Planning Panel

Reference: 10/00035/FUL
Application at: Doctors Surgery 40 Moorcroft Road York YO24 2RQ
For: Erection of 2 storey GP surgery building after demolition of existing building
By: The Partners York Medical Group
Application Type: Full Application
Target Date: 8 March 2010

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 The application seeks planning permission for the demolition of the existing doctors surgery and its replacement with a new two-storey surgery. The current surgery is located close to a bend along Moorcroft Road. It sits immediately adjacent to 38 Moorcroft Road and sides onto the rear gardens of 42 to 46 Moorcroft Road. The building still retains its domestic character, with the exception of a timber porch to the front, which serves as the reception area. A single storey flat roof extension is also present to the rear, which projects out some 3.7m. A single off-street car parking space is provided to the front. The highway immediately outside does not have any parking restrictions. The surgery currently operates with two consulting rooms and a treatment room at ground floor with the first floor unable to be used by patients.

1.2 The application site has been in use as a doctor's surgery for over 25 years, being converted from a residential property. In support the applicant has stated that patient needs and the National Health Service and the Primary Care Trust (PCT) services have changed considerably over this time and the building is no longer considered suitable to meet the current needs. North Yorkshire and York PCT undertook a suitability report in 2008, which severely criticised the existing building. The report graded the physical condition, functional suitability, energy performance, development capacity, location and quality at "D", being at risk of imminent breakdown, unacceptable in present condition and falling dangerously below the acceptable "B" rating. The practice has looked at relocating within the vicinity for a number of years with no acceptable sites coming forward. As such the application seeks permission to redevelop the existing site.

1.3 The application has been called to Committee by Cllr Anne Reid due to concerns raised by local residents.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Air safeguarding GMS Constraints: Air Field safeguarding 0175

City Boundary GMS Constraints: York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams GMS Constraints: West Area 0004

2.2 Policies:

CYGP1
Design

CYC1
Criteria for community facilities

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

Internal

3.1 Highway Network Management - No objections in principle to the scheme. However, there were initial concerns regarding vehicular parking due to the additional patients. The site currently has one parking space, which would not be increased and therefore does not meet the Council parking standards for medical practices. However, it is likely that the patients will be from the surrounding area so vehicle movements would be kept to a minimum. There are also car parking facilities available close by at the shopping parade.

3.2 Environmental Protection Unit - No objections but suggest hours of opening condition

External

3.3 Neighbours - Letters of objection received from 29, 38, 46 and 49 Moorcroft Road, 108 Bramble Dene on the following grounds:

- Two storey building would not fit with the character of the area
- Loss of privacy from first floor rear windows
- Parking on Moorcroft Road, Bramble Dean and alongside the shops caused problems, especially with buses and delivery vans
- Double yellow lines are present at the junction of Moorcroft Road and Bramble Dene but this only pushes the parking further down the road
- Visitors should park to the rear of the shops but it appears that patients are unaware these spaces exist
- Increase in consulting rooms will lead to increased number of patients being seen to at one time and increased parking problems
- Disturbance caused by construction
- Nesting birds should be protected either in the undergrowth or nesting boxes
- Staff and patients park in the public house car park leaving no space for its own clients

- Existing gap (about 3m) should be kept between no.38 Moorcroft Rd and the application site, if narrowed it would create a rubbish trap and possible noise problems
- Existing surface water drainage problems need to be taken into account
- The proposed medical training could take place elsewhere, allowing the scheme to be scaled down
- Given the nil increase in the number of employees, and the need to consider the impact on adjacent property, the proposal for two additional consulting rooms is excessive

3.4 Dringhouses and Woodthorpe Planning Panel – Do not object but wish to make the following comments:

- Support the demolition of the existing building which is not fit for purpose
- Provides better healthcare and consulting services with more space and facilities within the same location
- Parking and road marking should be addressed as this is a busy road and a bus route
- Rear extension should be pitched roof rather than flat roof

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 Key considerations

- Design and impact on residential amenity
- Highway Implications

4.2 The relevant City of York Council Draft Deposit Local Plan policies are GP1 and C1. Policy GP1 'Design' of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft includes the expectation that development proposals will, inter alia; respect or enhance the local environment; be of a density, layout, scale, mass and design that is compatible with neighbouring buildings and spaces, ensure residents living nearby are not unduly affected by noise, disturbance overlooking, overshadowing or dominated by overbearing structures, use materials appropriate to the area; avoid the loss of open spaces or other features that contribute to the landscape; incorporate appropriate landscaping and retain, enhance or create urban spaces, public views, skyline, landmarks and other features that make a significant contribution to the character of the area. Policy C1 states that planning applications for social, health, community and religious facilities will be granted permission provided that; the proposed development is of a scale and design appropriate to the character and appearance of the locality; and it would meet a recognised need.

DESIGN

4.3 The proposed replacement building has been designed to appear as a residential property. The main section would have a ridge height at 7.9m (500mm higher than existing) stepping down to 7.2m for a section adjacent to number 38 Moorcroft Road, which is at this height. The existing property takes the form of a dormer bungalow with low eaves. The proposed surgery would increase the eaves to create a more usable first floor area. The eaves would be at 4.7m. Due to this increase in height two windows would be located to the first floor rear elevation, where none were

previously present. The building would sit on a similar footprint to the original, although an increase of 10m² is proposed by single storey flat roofed elements to the front and rear. The existing carport to the side would be removed and the two-storey structure moved closure to number 38, still leaving 1m to its blank side elevation. The new surgery would provide two consulting rooms and a treatment room at ground floor and two consulting rooms at first floor.

4.4 The application property is part of a run of 4 similar detached houses. Whilst a more traditional two-storey structure, it is considered that the proposed building has been designed to reflect the surrounding residential properties. It has retained a ridge height at a similar level to neighbouring properties and a similar footprint to the existing. It would sit closer to number 38 Moorcroft Road but this is not to the detriment of the street scene.

4.5 A sustainability statement has been submitted detailing carbon emissions, use of sustainable, renewable and recycled materials and water resources. The Sustainable Design and Construction IPS would not require a BREEAM assessment for this development.

RESIDENTIAL AMENITY

4.6 As the existing property is a dormer bungalow and the proposed surgery is more of a traditional two-storey property with higher eaves there would be an increase in the bulk of the structure. This would have an impact upon the amenity of 42, 44 and 46 Moorcroft Road, which lie immediately to the north of the application site. These properties are located around a 90-degree bend in Moorcroft Road and as such they back onto the application site. The rear elevations of these properties lie at a distance of 13m to the proposed side elevation of the new surgery. However, number 40 Moorcroft Road has an existing single storey extension, containing a dining room and a playroom, which brings it to within 10m of the proposed surgery. Due to the orientation the overshadowing which already occurs to these properties would be slightly increased, especially within the winter months. However, this increase would not appear to be so severe as to warrant a refusal based solely on these grounds.

4.7 The flat roof rear element projects further to the rear and marginally closer to number 38 Moorcroft Road than at present but it will be located 2m from the common boundary and being located to the north of no.38 is not considered that it would have any detrimental impact in terms of loss of light or over-dominance.

4.8 Concerns have also been raised regarding loss of privacy from the proposed first floor windows. However, these would overlook the rear section of the garden of no.108 Bramble Dene and would not look directly onto any nearby residential properties.

HIGHWAY IMPLICATIONS

4.9 Concerns have been raised in connection with the lack of off street parking. The plans indicate the provision of a single off road car parking space. The current parking standards would require a maximum of one space per professional staff, one

per four other staff and two per consulting room. The proposed surgery would double the current consulting rooms and would likely increase patient numbers and trips to the surgery. At present on street parking occurs to both sides of the road, due to no parking restrictions immediately to the front, and visitors often park within the public house car park opposite and adjacent side streets. However, public car parking facilities are available to the rear of the local shopping parade, some 70m from the surgery. It is considered that many of the visitors to the surgery would live within the vicinity and as such it should be easily accessible by foot. It is also considered that if alternative sites for the proposal could not be found within the immediate area and the surgery were to relocate out of its catchment area it would considerably increase vehicular movement to the alternative facility forming a less sustainable form of development.

4.10 Whilst objections from neighbours have been taken into account it is considered that the lack of car parking within the site should not result in the refusal of the scheme. Highway Network Management have stated that if parking problems worsen as a result of the new surgery parking restriction could be placed on Moorcroft Road. In addition the surgery should be encouraged to direct patients to park within the public car park and not on the highway.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 It is considered that the proposed replacement surgery would not have any detrimental impact upon the character and appearance of the area. The design is in keeping with neighbouring properties and whilst a certain loss of light would occur to neighbours the distance between the rear elevation of the properties and the surgery is considered acceptable. Increased traffic movements and the lack of on site parking provision do give rise for concern. However, on balance, it is considered that relocating the facility outside of the catchment area would be detrimental to the patients and would create additional vehicle movements, creating a less sustainable scheme. If parking on the highway were to increase and cause potential vehicle conflicts placing parking restrictions on the highway could be investigated. The proposal is considered to comply with policy GP1 and C1 of the Development Control Local Plan.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 TIME2 Development start within three years

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out only in accordance with the following plans and other submitted details:-

Drawing numbers FOX/0001/09/1001 Rev A and FOX/0001/09/1002 Rev A received 1 February 2010

or any plans or details subsequently agreed in writing by the Local Planning

Authority as an amendment to the approved plans.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 VISQ8 Samples of exterior materials to be app

4 The doctor's surgery shall not be open except between the hours of 0800 and 1800 on Mondays to Fridays and 0800 to 1000 on Saturdays and not at all on Sundays or Bank Holidays.

Reason: To safeguard the amenities of local residents.

5 The hours of construction, loading or unloading on the site shall be confined to 8:00 to 18:00 Monday to Friday, 9:00 to 13:00 Saturday and no working on Sundays or public holidays.

Reason: To protect the amenities of adjacent residents.

6 DRAIN1 Drainage details to be agreed

7 HT1 7.9m

8 HWAY18 - Cycle parking details to be agreed

7.0 INFORMATIVES: Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to residential amenity, the character of the area or highway safety. As such the proposal complies with Policies GP1 and C1 of the City of York Development Control Local Plan.

2. PARKING AND INFORMATION FOR VISITORS

The applicant is requested to make patients aware of the nearby car park, cycle parking facilities and bus routes in order to minimise parking on the public highway. Reference to these facilities could be given in surgery literature and letters to patients, information for new patients, on appointment cards etc.

. DEMOLITION AND CONSTRUCTION

The developer's attention is drawn to the various requirements for the control of noise on construction sites laid down in the Control of Pollution Act 1974. In order to ensure that residents are not adversely affected by air pollution and noise, the

following guidance should be followed, failure to do so could result in formal action being taken under the Control of Pollution Act 1974:

- i. The work shall be carried out in such a manner so as to comply with the general recommendations of British Standards BS 5228: Part 1: 1997, a code of practice for "Noise and Vibration Control on Construction and Open Sites" and in particular Section 10 of Part 1 of the code entitled "Control of noise and vibration".
- ii. All plant and machinery to be operated, sited and maintained in order to minimise disturbance. All items of machinery powered by internal combustion engines must be properly silenced and/or fitted with effective and well-maintained mufflers in accordance with manufacturers instructions.
- iii. The best practicable means, as defined by Section 72 of the Control of Pollution Act 1974, shall be employed at all times, in order to minimise noise emissions.
- v. All reasonable measures shall be employed in order to control and minimise dust emissions, including sheeting of vehicles and use of water for dust suppression.
- vi. There shall be no bonfires on the site

Contact details:

Author: Heather Fairy (Mon - Wed) Development Control Officer
Tel No: 01904 551668